BY MAIL and E-MAIL:

Ms. Susan Panepento
Chair, NYC Office of Collective Bargaining
100 Gold Street, 4th Fl.
New York, NY 10038

Mr. Seth Agata
Chairman, NYC Public Employment Relations Board
P.O. Box 2074
Empire State Plaza
Agency Building 2, Floors 18 & 20
Albany, NY 12074

March 24, 2016

Dear Chairperson Panepento and Chairman Agata:

The conduct of the NYC Patrolman's Benevolent Association, and specifically its leadership, during and in the aftermath of its recent interest arbitration proceeding is nothing short of reprehensible. It is inexcusable and highly unprofessional for the PBA to take its dissatisfaction with the outcome of a case to the Arbitrator's personal residence.

The undersigned Arbitrators wish to express zero tolerance for bullying or the public vilification of any Arbitrator who seeks to perform a public service by agreeing to serve as Arbitrator. Accordingly, the undersigned do not want their names sent out for consideration in any arbitration case in which the NYC PBA is a party. By signing below, the Arbitrators are indicating that they have not been intimidated by the bullying and vitriol spewed by the PBA leadership. Rather, we are too experienced and accomplished in our field to devote any time working with parties who disrespect the arbitration process and the Arbitrators who serve. We will continue to decide cases honorably and with integrity based on the evidence and arguments presented in the record. However, we will NOT work with the NYC PBA on any arbitration case.

We request that you forward this letter to the PBA's counsel and to any PBA leadership who routinely receive your communications. By forwarding this letter, the PBA will

page 2

know that the list of available Arbitrators from which the Agency can designate is substantially diminished.

Thank you for your assistance.

Carol Wittenberg

Richard Adelman

s/ Elliott Shriftman

s/ Stephen M. Bluth

s/ Joseph Licata

s/ J.J. Pierson

s/ Gary T. Kendellen

s/ Robert A. Grey

s/ Robert E. Light

s/ Richard J. Roth

s/ Richard M. Gaba

s/ David N. Stein

Bonnie S. Weinstock

s/ Mattye M. Gandel

s/ Janet M. Spencer

s/ Ira Cure

s/Susan Meredith

s/ John Trela

s/ Michael Pecklers

s/ Roger E. Maher

s/ Joseph Harris

s/ Randall M. Kelly

s/ Arthur A. Riegel

s/ John E. Sands

s/ Dennis J. Campagna

s/ Gayle Gavin

s/ Marilyn M. Levine

cc: Robert Linn, NYC Commissioner of Labor

Harry Nespoli, Chair, MLC

Richard Steier, Editor, The Chief-Civil Service Leader